

# MIAMIBEACH

OFFICE OF THE CITY MANAGER

LTC #

046-2016

## LETTER TO COMMISSION

TO: Mayor Philip Levine and Members of the City Commission

FROM: Jimmy L. Morales, City Manager

DATE: January 21, 2016

SUBJECT: Cleanliness Index & Assessment Program Results for FY 2015/16 Quarter 1

The purpose of this Letter to Commission is to communicate the results of the award winning Cleanliness Index and Assessment program from FY 2015/16 Quarter 1 (October 1, 2015 to December 31, 2015).

### Background

The Miami Beach Public Area Cleanliness Index is an objective measurement of performance ranging from 1.0 (Very Clean) to 6.0 (Very Dirty) and includes assessments of litter, garbage cans/dumpsters, organic material, and fecal matter. The results of the assessments are used to monitor the impacts of recently implemented initiatives to target areas for future improvements, and assure the quality of services. Quarterly sample sizes are set to ensure no greater than a  $\pm 5.0$  percentage point sampling error given the 95% confidence level for each of the public areas assessed.

During FY 2006/07, the City tightened the target for the Citywide and area-specific cleanliness indicators from 2.0 to 1.5 – the lower the score on the cleanliness index indicates a cleaner area. This target continues to be the same through FY 2007/08, FY 2008/09, FY 2009/10, FY 2010/11, FY 2011/12, FY 2012/13, FY 2013/14, FY 2014/15 and FY 2015/16. As important, the City also has a goal to ensure that 90 percent of assessments score 2.0 or better, with awareness to seasonal fluctuations.

### Summary of the Cleanliness Assessment Results FY 2015/16 Quarter 1

Overall, the citywide cleanliness index improved during FY 2015/16 Quarter 1 when compared to the same quarter in FY 2014/15. In general, the City's cleanliness has steadily progressed as evidenced by the index, anecdotal information, and results of our most recent resident survey. Additionally, 88.5% of all public area assessments scored 2.0 or better (target=90%) in FY 2015/16 Quarter 1. Cleanliness continues to remain a top priority for the City.

### Positive and Stable Areas in FY 2015/16 Quarter 1

- **Parks-** Parks improved to 1.41 a 6.6% increase from the prior quarter but declined 6.8% from the prior FY quarter. Litter control crews, along with regular enforcement of litter control standards, support this ongoing improvement. Parks will continue to monitor cleanliness of parks and adjust as needed.

- **Parking Lots** - Scores improved to 1.63, a 20.9% increase from the prior quarter and 7.4% increase from the same quarter in FY 2014/15. The Greenspace Division performed an evaluation of the contractor's maintenance practices and recommended that the landscape maintenance services be performed by an all-purpose crew that can complete a full service in one visit before they left the site for the day. The process of notification of appearance deficiencies has been adjusted to ensure a timely response by staff as well.
- **Sidewalks**— Sidewalks improved 57.2% to 1.45 compared to the prior quarter and 4.0% from prior FY quarter. Increased levels of organic material contributed to the decline in quarter 4. Public Works is working with communications on best approach to outreach to residents regarding the cleanliness of sidewalks in residential areas, especially during the summer months when instances of organic material increase significantly.
- **Beaches** - Beaches improved to 1.34 and 1.32 for areas covered by Miami Beach and Miami-Dade County respectively. An initiative to trim the sea grapes in the dunes and beach spoil areas resulted in a decline in scores in quarter 4 due to the delay in pick-up of the cut organic material. Additionally, excess seaweed deposits from May through September have been noted throughout the state shoreline.

#### **Areas of Focus in FY 2015/16 Quarter 1**

- **Streets**— Streets overall improved by 3.6% to 1.60 in quarter 1 when compared to the prior quarter and declined 8.1 percent when compared to the same quarter in FY 2014/15. However, streets in the commercial entertainment areas and commercial non-entertainment areas continue to exceed the target of 1.50 at 1.35 and 1.48 respectively. Code has addressed prior concerns regarding construction sites. Residential streets improved to 1.36, up 11.1% from the prior quarter. Overall, 92.7% of streets are scoring 2.0 or better, and remain stable when compared to the prior FY quarter.
- **Alleys**— Alleys improved by 14.7% to 1.86 from the prior quarter and 7.5% from the prior FY quarter. A contributing factor to this improvement may be related to the increase in sanitation fines effective September 2015. Waste fines, which include but are not limited to illegal disposal of biohazardous and/or hazardous waste increased from \$250 for first offense to \$1,000; and illegal disposal of garbage, trash and/or industrial waste increased from \$50 to \$200 for first offense. In addition to the above fine process, the Code Department recently hired 5 Code Compliance Officers and is in the process of filling 5 additional vacancies; once trained, the new hires will sustain an increased enforcement for all shifts responsible for sanitation detail.
- **Waterways** - Scores improved 30.1% compared to the prior quarter and continue to be an area of focus with scores amongst the lowest at 1.86 when compared to all assessment areas. The City's waterway contractor provides service three days per week (Monday, Wednesday, and Friday) since November 2014. The contractor alternates between a north route and a south route during which staff focuses on removing debris from hotspots and any other accumulations of debris identified on their way to and from these hotspots. Code will continue to conduct inspections and area sweeps of the out lots to support this effort.

Cleanliness Index Score Per Public Area (target = 1.5)

| Public Area                      | FY05/06 |      |      |      |          |
|----------------------------------|---------|------|------|------|----------|
|                                  | Q1      | Q2   | Q3   | Q4   | FY Score |
| <b>Overall City Score</b>        | 2.20    | 1.94 | 2.24 | 2.03 | 2.10     |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 2.07    | 1.98 | 2.22 | 1.84 | 2.03     |
| Not including alleys             | 1.99    | 1.85 | 2.16 | 1.74 | 1.94     |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.84    | 1.78 | 2.44 | 1.74 | 1.95     |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.89    | 1.87 | 1.81 | 1.75 | 1.83     |
| Residential                      | 2.25    | 1.93 | 2.11 | 1.74 | 2.01     |
| Alleys                           | 2.46    | 2.59 | 2.76 | 2.49 | 2.60     |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 2.02    | 2.05 | 2.33 | 1.84 | 2.05     |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.87    | 1.95 | 2.50 | 1.86 | 2.04     |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.97    | 2.15 | 1.91 | 1.79 | 1.95     |
| Residential                      | 2.28    | 2.11 | 2.35 | 1.83 | 2.14     |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 2.08    | 1.53 | 1.93 | 2.04 | 1.90     |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 2.25    | 2.25 | 2.30 | 2.01 | 2.21     |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 2.77    | 2.12 | 2.53 | 2.53 | 2.59     |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |         |      |      |      |          |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 2.02    | 1.58 | 1.80 | 1.91 | 1.85     |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 1.95    | 1.78 | 2.04 | 1.95 | 1.93     |

| Public Area                      | FY05/06  | FY11/12  | FY12/13  | FY13/14  | FY14/15  | FY15/16  | % change from prior FY score | % change from base FY score |
|----------------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                                  | FY Score | FY Score | FY Score | FY Score | FY Score | FY Score |                              |                             |
| <b>Overall City Score</b>        | 2.10     | 1.59     | 1.48     | 1.57     | 1.75     |          |                              |                             |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 2.03     | 1.55     | 1.47     | 1.55     | 1.54     |          |                              |                             |
| Not including alleys             | 1.94     | 1.45     | 1.36     | 1.43     | 1.39     |          |                              |                             |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.95     | 1.44     | 1.37     | 1.42     | 1.33     |          |                              |                             |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.83     | 1.50     | 1.42     | 1.47     | 1.44     |          |                              |                             |
| Residential                      | 2.01     | 1.43     | 1.32     | 1.41     | 1.47     |          |                              |                             |
| Alleys                           | 2.60     | 1.84     | 1.77     | 1.88     | 1.92     |          |                              |                             |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 2.05     | 1.45     | 1.36     | 1.47     | 1.57     |          |                              |                             |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 2.04     | 1.43     | 1.37     | 1.41     | 1.54     |          |                              |                             |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.95     | 1.57     | 1.42     | 1.58     | 1.63     |          |                              |                             |
| Residential                      | 2.14     | 1.42     | 1.31     | 1.46     | 2.02     |          |                              |                             |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 1.90     | 1.44     | 1.38     | 1.46     | 1.37     |          |                              |                             |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 2.21     | 1.75     | 1.63     | 1.63     | 1.76     |          |                              |                             |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 2.59     | 1.95     | 1.72     | 1.87     | 2.21     |          |                              |                             |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |          |          |          |          |          |          |                              |                             |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 1.85     | 1.36     | 1.40     | 1.45     | 1.64     |          |                              |                             |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 1.93     | 1.42     | 1.46     | 1.41     | 1.55     |          |                              |                             |

| Public Area                      | FY14/15 |      |      |      |          | % change from prior FY score | % change from base FY score |
|----------------------------------|---------|------|------|------|----------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                                  | Q1      | Q2   | Q3   | Q4   | FY Score |                              |                             |
| <b>Overall City Score</b>        | 1.60    | 1.45 | 1.75 | 2.19 | 1.75     | 11.4%                        | -15.6%                      |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 1.48    | 1.43 | 1.59 | 1.66 | 1.54     | -0.6%                        | -24.1%                      |
| Not including alleys             | 1.36    | 1.35 | 1.46 | 1.40 | 1.39     | -2.8%                        | -28.3%                      |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.25    | 1.29 | 1.41 | 1.34 | 1.33     | -6.3%                        | -31.7%                      |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.45    | 1.42 | 1.45 | 1.41 | 1.44     | -2.0%                        | -21.3%                      |
| Residential                      | 1.36    | 1.39 | 1.59 | 1.53 | 1.47     | 4.2%                         | -26.8%                      |
| Alleys                           | 2.01    | 1.62 | 1.87 | 2.18 | 1.92     | 2.1%                         | -26.1%                      |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 1.51    | 1.37 | 1.59 | 3.39 | 1.97     | 34.0%                        | -4.3%                       |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.45    | 1.31 | 1.51 | 1.78 | 1.54     | 9.2%                         | -24.5%                      |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.56    | 1.50 | 1.66 | 1.78 | 1.63     | 3.1%                         | -16.4%                      |
| Residential                      | 1.44    | 1.25 | 1.59 | 3.76 | 2.02     | 38.3%                        | -5.6%                       |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 1.32    | 1.29 | 1.36 | 1.51 | 1.37     | -6.1%                        | -27.8%                      |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 1.76    | 1.43 | 1.77 | 2.06 | 1.76     | 7.9%                         | -20.3%                      |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 2.04    | 1.79 | 2.36 | 2.66 | 2.21     | 18.1%                        | -14.6%                      |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |         |      |      |      |          |                              |                             |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 1.45    | 1.41 | 1.81 | 1.86 | 1.64     | 13.1%                        | -11.3%                      |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 1.48    | 1.28 | 1.61 | 1.88 | 1.55     | 9.9%                         | -19.6%                      |

| Public Area                      | FY15/16 |    |    |    | FY Score | % change from prior Qtr | % change in prior FY Qtr | % change from same quarter in base year |
|----------------------------------|---------|----|----|----|----------|-------------------------|--------------------------|---|
|                                  | Q1      | Q2 | Q3 | Q4 |          |                         |                          |   |
| <b>Overall City Score</b>        | 1.55    |    |    |    |          | -29.2%                  | -3.1%                    | -29.5%                                  |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 1.60    |    |    |    |          | -3.6%                   | 8.1%                     | -22.7%                                  |
| Not including alleys             | 1.41    |    |    |    |          | 0.7%                    | 3.7%                     | -29.1%                                  |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.35    |    |    |    |          | 0.7%                    | 5.5%                     | -26.6%                                  |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.48    |    |    |    |          | 5.0%                    | 1.4%                     | -21.7%                                  |
| Residential                      | 1.36    |    |    |    |          | -11.1%                  | 0.0%                     | -39.6%                                  |
| Alleys                           | 1.85    |    |    |    |          | -14.7%                  | -7.5%                    | -24.4%                                  |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 1.45    |    |    |    |          | -57.2%                  | -4.0%                    | -28.2%                                  |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 1.41    |    |    |    |          | -20.8%                  | -2.8%                    | -24.6%                                  |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 1.57    |    |    |    |          | -11.8%                  | 0.6%                     | -20.3%                                  |
| Residential                      | 1.34    |    |    |    |          | -64.4%                  | -6.9%                    | -41.2%                                  |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 1.41    |    |    |    |          | -5.6%                   | 6.8%                     | -32.2%                                  |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 1.63    |    |    |    |          | -20.9%                  | -7.4%                    | -27.6%                                  |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 1.85    |    |    |    |          | -30.1%                  | -8.8%                    | -32.9%                                  |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |         |    |    |    |          |                         |                          |   |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 1.34    |    |    |    |          | -28.0%                  | -10.1%                   | -33.7%                                  |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 1.32    |    |    |    |          | -29.8%                  | -9.6%                    | -32.7%                                  |



Percentage of Assessments scoring 2.0 or better (target = 86%)

| Public Area                      | FY09/10 |       |       |       |          |
|----------------------------------|---------|-------|-------|-------|----------|
|                                  | Q1      | Q2    | Q3    | Q4    | FY Score |
| <b>Citizenship</b>               | 57.5%   | 71.1% | 55.7% | 75.5% | 65.2%    |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 65.7%   | 79.2% | 63.9% | 84.8% | 73.4%    |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 66.1%   | 81.1% | 47.5% | 74.6% | 67.3%    |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 76.7%   | 72.2% | 82.4% | 87.9% | 82.3%    |
| Residential                      | 56.8%   | 84.6% | 55.2% | 86.1% | 73.5%    |
| Alleys                           | 37.7%   | 36.8% | 37.0% | 56.2% | 41.9%    |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 62.6%   | 68.7% | 55.4% | 79.3% | 65.7%    |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 65.2%   | 71.8% | 41.7% | 71.7% | 63.5%    |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 63.5%   | 56.4% | 79.8% | 87.4% | 71.8%    |
| Residential                      | 52.4%   | 78.1% | 52.1% | 82.2% | 65.2%    |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 46.3%   | 88.0% | 58.2% | 63.8% | 65.5%    |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 48.0%   | 59.5% | 49.2% | 69.0% | 55.4%    |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 42.9%   | 83.7% | 34.5% | 56.8% | 54.5%    |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |         |       |       |       |          |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 64.1%   | 83.8% | 55.0% | 78.5% | 73.1%    |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 75.3%   | 78.4% | 53.9% | 77.2% | 71.2%    |

| Public Area                      | FY12/13  | FY13/14  |
|----------------------------------|----------|----------|
|                                  | FY Score | FY Score |
| <b>Citizenship</b>               | 89.1%    | 87.2%    |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 92.7%    | 91.4%    |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 94.4%    | 92.1%    |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 91.3%    | 91.3%    |
| Residential                      | 92.5%    | 90.8%    |
| Alleys                           | 81.5%    | 77.8%    |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 92.9%    | 90.2%    |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 94.0%    | 92.3%    |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 91.3%    | 88.1%    |
| Residential                      | 93.6%    | 90.1%    |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 92.5%    | 90.3%    |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 85.8%    | 86.1%    |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 80.0%    | 79.4%    |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |          |          |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 93.4%    | 92.5%    |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 91.5%    | 93.2%    |

| Public Area                      | FY14/15 |       |       |       |          | Difference from prior Qtr | Difference from base FY score |
|----------------------------------|---------|-------|-------|-------|----------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
|                                  | Q1      | Q2    | Q3    | Q4    | FY Score |                           |                               |
| <b>Citizenship</b>               | 86.0%   | 91.3% | 87.3% | 73.9% | 84.6%    | -18.4%                    | 10.4%                         |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 93.8%   | 93.9% | 92.9% | 90.0% | 92.6%    | -2.8%                     | 18.2%                         |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 95.0%   | 95.0% | 94.9% | 93.8% | 94.7%    | -1.1%                     | 27.4%                         |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 91.3%   | 93.0% | 92.7% | 90.9% | 92.0%    | -1.8%                     | 8.7%                          |
| Residential                      | 94.2%   | 93.8% | 91.2% | 85.4% | 91.2%    | -6.8%                     | 17.7%                         |
| Alleys                           | 69.0%   | 83.6% | 90.5% | 54.4% | 74.4%    | -18.1%                    | 32.6%                         |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 89.1%   | 93.5% | 85.1% | 81.5% | 82.3%    | -28.8%                    | 16.8%                         |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 90.3%   | 93.9% | 86.8% | 78.6% | 87.4%    | -8.2%                     | 23.8%                         |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 87.3%   | 90.6% | 83.1% | 77.8% | 84.7%    | -6.9%                     | 12.9%                         |
| Residential                      | 89.6%   | 95.0% | 85.4% | 28.0% | 74.8%    | -67.4%                    | 8.8%                          |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 94.3%   | 94.0% | 96.7% | 88.5% | 93.4%    | -8.2%                     | 26.8%                         |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 83.9%   | 91.3% | 81.2% | 55.0% | 80.4%    | -18.2%                    | 24.0%                         |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 71.8%   | 77.0% | 92.5% | 45.4% | 64.5%    | -18.2%                    | 10.0%                         |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |         |       |       |       |          |                           |                               |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 89.4%   | 90.2% | 82.4% | 75.8% | 84.5%    | -8.8%                     | 11.4%                         |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 88.7%   | 94.8% | 85.4% | 74.6% | 85.9%    | -10.8%                    | 14.7%                         |

| Public Area                      | FY15/16 |    |    |    |          | Difference from prior Qtr | Difference from prior FY Qtr | Difference from base FY Qtr |
|----------------------------------|---------|----|----|----|----------|---------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
|                                  | Q1      | Q2 | Q3 | Q4 | FY Score |                           |                              |                             |
| <b>Citizenship</b>               | 88.5%   |    |    |    |          | 14.8%                     | 2.6%                         | 51.0%                       |
| <b>Streets</b>                   | 92.7%   |    |    |    |          | 2.7%                      | -0.8%                        | 27.0%                       |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 94.3%   |    |    |    |          | 0.6%                      | -0.7%                        | 28.2%                       |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 91.2%   |    |    |    |          | 0.3%                      | -0.1%                        | 14.6%                       |
| Residential                      | 92.5%   |    |    |    |          | 7.2%                      | -1.8%                        | 36.8%                       |
| Alleys                           | 79.5%   |    |    |    |          | 16.1%                     | 10.6%                        | 41.8%                       |
| <b>Sidewalks</b>                 | 91.8%   |    |    |    |          | 38.1%                     | 2.6%                         | 28.8%                       |
| Commercial – Entertainment       | 94.5%   |    |    |    |          | 18.2%                     | 4.6%                         | 26.8%                       |
| Commercial – Non-Entertainment   | 88.8%   |    |    |    |          | 11.0%                     | 1.6%                         | 25.3%                       |
| Residential                      | 91.3%   |    |    |    |          | 83.3%                     | 1.7%                         | 38.5%                       |
| <b>Parks</b>                     | 92.3%   |    |    |    |          | 3.8%                      | -2.0%                        | 46.0%                       |
| <b>Parking</b>                   | 86.5%   |    |    |    |          | 21.6%                     | 2.8%                         | 38.6%                       |
| <b>Waterway</b>                  | 80.5%   |    |    |    |          | 34.1%                     | 8.7%                         | 37.6%                       |
| <b>Beach Areas</b>               |         |    |    |    |          |                           |                              |                             |
| Miami Beach Responsibility Only  | 93.1%   |    |    |    |          | 17.3%                     | 3.7%                         | 28.0%                       |
| Miami-Dade County Responsibility | 93.2%   |    |    |    |          | 18.4%                     | 4.8%                         | 17.7%                       |

### Cleanliness Key Intended Outcome

Cleanliness was identified in our community surveys as a key driver affecting overall quality of life. In addition, in the 2014 survey, residents and businesses rated cleanliness as one of the services the City should strive not to reduce. The City has implemented increases in service levels and community satisfaction levels have improved. Overall scores have improved by 16.6% from FY 2005/06 to FY 2014/15.

### **Next Quarter Assessments**

City part-time staff is conducting cleanliness assessments every quarter. Additionally, residents are always welcome to participate. If you or any member of your staff is interested in participating in the City's Public Area Cleanliness and Appearance Program, please contact Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld with Organization Development Performance Initiatives at extension 6923.

If you have any further questions, please feel free to contact me.

c: Eric Carpenter, Assistant City Manager and Public Works Director  
Mark Taxis, Assistant City Manager  
Kathie G. Brooks, Assistant City Manager  
Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld, Chief Learning Development Officer  
John Rebar, Parks and Recreation Director  
Saul Francis, Parking Director  
Mariano Fernandez, Building Director  
Hernan Cardeno, Code Compliance Director  
Robert Santos-Alborna, Code Compliance Division Director  
Al Zamora, Sanitation Division Director

EC/KGB/LDR

